

ADMINISTRATIVE LICENSE REVOCATION MANUAL

A Practitioner's Guide to Administrative License Revocation

Lawrence G. Boyd

INTRODUCTION

A Primer on Implied Consent and the Importance of ALR

CHAPTER 1

HIERARCHY OF GOVERNING ALR LAWS

CHAPTER 1—HIERARCHY OF GOVERNING ALR LAWS

Section I. Relationship of Governing Statutes

- A. Failure
- B. Refusal
- C. Both
- D. Conflicts Between SOAH Rules and the Transportation Code

Section II. Original ALR Statutes Control Over Transportation Code Revisions

- A. Generally
- B. Recodified Statutes
- C. Legislative and Constitutional Declarations Prohibiting Substantive Change
- D. Texas Supreme Court's Decisions Relating to Conflicts Between Former Statutes and Recodification

CHAPTER 2

SETTING AN ALR HEARING

Section I. Preliminary Procedural Steps Required of Arresting Officer

- A. Contents of the Notice
- B. Consequence of Misstated/Omitted Grounds
- C. Method of Service of Notice
- D. Rescission of Notice

Section II. Report to DPS by Arresting Officer (Form DIC-23)

- A. Generally—No More Requirement for a “Sworn Report” in an ALR Hearing for Either a Ch. 524 (“Failure”) Hearing or a Ch. 724 (“Refusal”) Hearing
- B. Status of Five-Day Rule
- C. Contents of the Officer's Sworn Report in a Failure Case:
The “Complaint” Requirement
- D. Contents of the Statutory Warning (Form DIC-24) As a Mandatory Component of the Arresting Officer's Report in Refusal Cases

Section III. Initial Decision: In Person or by Telephone

- A. General Rule Regarding Telephone Hearings
- B. Advantages in a Telephone Hearing
- C. Method of Request
- D. Deadline Compliance
- E. Sufficiency of Information in Request

- F. Rejection Notice From DPS
- G. Missed the Fifteen-Day Deadline?
- H. Defendant's Right to Waive Hearing Demand

Section IV. Notice Requirements

- A. Shall: When It Means "Shall" and When It Means "May"
- B. Timing
- C. Contents of DPS's Notice of Hearing/Trial Amendments
- D. Location of Hearing
- E. Hearing Officer

Section V. What Happens After You Win the Hearing

- A. Rescinding the Suspension
- B. Reinstatement of License: Fee Requirement

Section VI. What Happens After You Lose the Hearing

CHAPTER 3

PREHEARING STRATEGIES

Section I. Prehearing Discovery Pursuant to SOAH Rules

- A. Discovery Rules Changed on January 1, 2017

Section II. Right to Require Presence of Witnesses

- A. Rules Regarding Compensation for a Subpoenaed Witness
- B. SOAH Regulations Governing Subpoenas at ALR Hearings Were Modified Effective January 1, 2017
- C. Obtaining a Subpoena for the Breath-Test Operator ("BTO") and/or Technical Supervisor ("Tech. Sup.") for the ALR Hearing

Section III. Continuances

- A. Defense Continuances
- B. DPS Continuance

Section IV. Decision of ALJ and Effective Date of Suspension

Section V. Withdrawal of Counsel

Section VI. Failure to Appear; Vacating Default Order

- A. General Rule
- B. DPS Burden
- C. Vacating a Default Order
- D. Appearance by Counsel/Decision to Have Client at Hearing
- E. Rescission and Expunction

CHAPTER 4

THE STEPS TO A SUCCESSFUL HEARING

Section I. Why Have an ALR Hearing?

- A. The Easy Win
- B. It May Be Your Only Chance for Discovery

Section II. The ALR Advantage

Section III. A Must-Do Checklist

- A. Demand the Hearing by Fax
- B. Demand Discovery

- C. Request a Subpoena for the Breath-Test Operator and the Technical Supervisor (after September 1, 2009)
- D. Keep an Eye Out for Your Initial Notice of Hearing
- E. Use Your Five-Day Continuance
- F. Subpoena the Arresting Officer

Section IV. The Blueprint for Cross-Examination

- A. Arresting Officers
- B. Technical Supervisors
- C. Breath-Test Operators

Section V. Effective Use of the ALR Hearing in the Criminal (DWI) Trial

- A. The Right to Confront and Cross-Examine the Arresting Officer at the Criminal Trial
- B. Impeachment by Evidence of Prior Inconsistent Statements
- C. Cross-Examination at the Criminal Trial Concerning Field Sobriety Tests

CHAPTER 5

DPS's PROOF AT THE ALR HEARING

Section I. Suspension Law Inapplicable When Not Under Arrest

- A. Authority
- B. In Texas "Arrest" Is Defined by Statute
- C. Recent Court Decisions: Defendant Taken to Hospital Not Under Arrest
- D. Significance of Why and How Blood Sample Was Taken

Section II. Source of the Elements

- A. Issues for Failure Hearing Under Transportation Code Chapter 524
- B. Issues for Refusal Hearing Under Transportation Code Chapter 724

Section III. Stops and Arrests

- A. Determining the Standard
- B. Preserving Complaints of Illegal Arrests and Detentions

CHAPTER 6

VEHICULAR STOPS: REASONABLE SUSPICION AND PROBABLE CAUSE

Section I. Reasonable Suspicion: The Standard

- A. Cases Where Court Did Not Require AO Testimony That AO Believed Defendant Was DWI
- B. Case Where Court Required AO Testimony That AO Believed Defendant Was DWI

Section II. What Constitutes a Stop?

- A. Defining the Terms
- B. Examples of "Mere Encounter"

Section III. Right to Stop

- A. Court of Criminal Appeals Rejects "As Consistent With Innocent Activity" Test
- B. Limits on Length and Purpose of Detention
- C. Conclusory Information Is Insufficient

Section IV. The Proper Standard for a Traffic Stop

- A. Sufficiency Examples
- B. Insufficiency Examples
- C. Special Problems Related to Speeding
- D. When Is Weaving Really a Traffic Violation?
- E. Can Officers Stalk Drivers to Develop Probable Cause?
- F. Practice Notes

Section V. When Reasonable Suspicion or Probable Cause Is Not Witnessed by Arresting Officer

- A. Reports From Unnamed Civilians
- B. Reports From Named Civilians
- C. Arrest Request From Another Officer
- D. Police Bulletin
- E. Observation Contradicting Information Received
- F. Proof of 911 Calls

Section VI. Vehicular Search Incident to Arrest

Table of Cases

CHAPTER 7

STOPS WHERE REASONABLE SUSPICION INAPPLICABLE

Section I. Checkpoint Stops

- A. DWI Checkpoints
- B. Non-DWI Checkpoints
- C. Multi-Purpose Checkpoint
- D. What Constitutes a Checkpoint?

Section II. Water Safety Check of Boats

Section III. Community Caretaking Stop

CHAPTER 8

BREACHES OF THE PEACE, CITIZEN'S ARRESTS, AND GEOGRAPHIC JURISDICTION

Section I. Citizen's Arrest

- A. Authorization
- B. DWI: Offense Against the Public Peace?
- C. Standard of Evidence

Section II. Geographic Jurisdiction

- A. Historically Speaking
- B. Current Rules of Jurisdiction
- C. *But see Dixon v. State*
- D. Special Types of Peace Officers

CHAPTER 9

PROBABLE CAUSE TO ARREST FOR DWI

Section I. Continued Detention for Field Sobriety Tests ("Intervening" Probable Cause)

- A. Limits on Length and Purpose of Detention
- B. Continued Detention to Wait for SFST Officer
- C. Factors Providing Reasonable Suspicion for Continued Detention

Section II. What Constitutes an Arrest in Texas

- A. Code of Criminal Procedure Definition
- B. Recent Appellate Trend Narrows What Qualifies

Section III. Probable Cause to Arrest

- A. Relationship of Texas and U.S. Constitutional Safeguards
- B. Federal Standard of Probable Cause
- C. Texas's Standard of Probable Cause: CCP Article Fourteen.

Section IV. Does Implied Consent Apply to Offenses Other Than DWI?

- A. Public Intoxication
- B. Arrest Involving Felony

Section V. Residence Entry Limitations to Warrantless Arrests

Section VI. Accident Investigations/Defendant's "Accident Investigation" Statement Regarding Driving

- A. Argument for Involuntariness Rejected by the Court of Criminal Appeals
- B. Accident Investigation/Authority to Investigate Accident/Monetary Amount/Confidentiality

Section VII. Probable Cause With Relation to the "Operating" Requirement

- A. The *Denton* Definition
- B. Pre-*Denton* Definition
- C. Pre-*Denton* Holdings
- D. DPS Does Not Have to Wheel the Defendant

CHAPTER 10

PROBABLE CAUSE REGARDING INTOXICATION

Section I. Standardized Field Sobriety Tests as Basis for "Intoxication"

- A. The Horizontal Gaze Nystagmus Test
- B. The Vertical Gaze Nystagmus Test
- C. The One-Leg-Stand and the Walk-and-Turn Tests

Section II. Probable Cause Regarding DWI Intoxication

- A. Definition
- B. Examples of Sufficient Probable Cause
- C. Examples of Insufficient Probable Cause
- D. The Portable Breath Test

Section III. Probable Cause Regarding Public Intoxication

- A. Definition
- B. Public Place Requirement
- C. "May Endanger" Element
- D. Statutory Defense to Public Intoxication

CHAPTER 11

PROBABLE CAUSE ELEMENTS IN ALR

Section I. Probable Cause Regarding “The Person” Element

- A. Person Other Than Defendant
- B. In-Court Identification

Section II. The “While” Element

- A. Relating Test Results to Time of Driving
- B. *Daubert-Kelly* Standard
- C. Requirement for Retrograde Extrapolation and Applicability to ALR Hearing
- D. Parallel Criminal Case
- E. Austin Court Incorrectly Applies *Geesa* Criminal Standard
- F. Applicable Civil Law Standard Parallels Pre-*Geesa* Criminal Standard
- G. Proof of Time of Driving
- H. Time of Drinking: Pre- or Post-Driving?

Section III. The “Operating” Element

- A. Defendant Passed-Out or Asleep in Vehicle
- B. Single Vehicle Accident Cases

Section IV. The “Motor Vehicle” Element

Section V. The “Public Place” Element

Section VI. The “Intoxicated” Element

Section VII. The “Placed Under Arrest” Element

Section VIII. The “Offered An Opportunity to Give a Specimen Under This Act” Element

- A. “Under This Act”
- B. Stating Incorrect Time for Alcohol Concentration

Section IX. The “Did the Person Refuse To Give A Specimen” Element

- A. Potential Defenses
- B. Constructive Refusal
- C. Invalid Defenses

Section X. The “On Proper Request of the Officer” Element

Section XI. Voluntariness Issues

- A. Consent Must Be Voluntary
- B. Involuntary Consent: *Erdman* Error
- C. Voluntariness When Sample Taken for Medical Purpose

CHAPTER 12

SPECIAL PROBLEMS OF PROOF AT ALR HEARINGS

Section I. Proof Required for Enhancement

- A. Proof Must Be Submitted at Hearing
- B. Sufficiency

Section II. Issues Unique to Proof Offered Through Documents

- A. The Hearsay Problem at the ALR Hearing
- B. Paper Cases: Objecting to Certain Common Defects in DPS’s Documentary Evidence

CHAPTER 13

BREATH TEST: RISK OF FALSE HIGH RESULTS

Section I. Relationship Between Number of Drinks Consumed and Alcohol Concentration

Section II. Risk Factors

- A. The Intoxilyzer 5000 and the “Averaging” Compromise
- B. “At The Time of Driving” Issue
- C. Risk of “Residual Alcohol”
- D. Forced Exhalation Risk
- E. Body Temperature Variations
- F. The Instrument’s Own Tolerance for Error
- G. Inability to Distinguish Between Alcohol and Other Substances
- H. Transient Error

Section III. Instrument Reliability and Analysis Validity

CHAPTER 14

THE BLOOD TEST

Section I. Taking of Blood Specimen

- A. General Rule
- B. Mandatory Requirement
- C. Refusal Is to Be Honored, Exceptions, and Search Warrants
- D. Lack of Refusal Does Not Mean Lack of Consent
- E. Who May Take Blood Specimen
- F. Right to Request Additional Specimen
- G. The “Justified Refusal” Doctrine/“Sanitary Place” and “Qualified Individual” Requirement for Blood Draws

Section II. Right of Discovery

- A. Defendant Has Right to Full Information Regarding Analysis
- B. SOAH Rules: Section 159.151. Prehearing Discovery

Section III. Blood Sample Requested by Officer

- A. Where Request Made When Not Under Arrest:
Suspension Law Does Not Apply
- B. General Constitutional Principles Trump Suspension Law

Section IV. Physician-Patient Privilege

- A. In Civil Cases
- B. In Criminal Cases

Section V. Practice Notes

- A. Commentary Regarding Admissibility of Blood Test Results in Criminal Cases
- B. The “While” Element
- C. Plasma or Serum Specimen Gives Reading Higher Than Whole Blood
Table of “Average” Conversion Factors Documented in Scientific Literature
- D. Other Potential Hospital Inaccuracy Factors
- E. Potential Error in Hospital-Drawn Cases Where Nonqualified Individual Draws Blood
- F. Interferants
- G. Acceptable Margin of Error

- H. Right to Confront & Cross-Examine State's Crime Lab Analyst
- I. Fourth Amendment Reasonableness Requirement When Blood Not Taken in Hospital or Medical Environment
- J. Suppressing Hospital-Drawn Blood Tests on the Basis of "Assault"

**Section VI. Proof of Intoxication in DWI Cases
by Substances Other Than Alcohol**

- A. Recent Pronouncements by the Court of Criminal Appeals Concerning Whether "Drug" Intoxication Evidence Requires Expert Testimony Regarding the Effect of the Drugs/ Preservation of Error at Trial and in the Appellate Process
- B. Courts of Appeals Have Held that it is Error to Admit Evidence of the Presence of a Controlled Substance in a Defendant's System Without Evidence of the Effect of the Substance and Retrograde Extrapolation

CHAPTER 15

HANDLING AN ALR APPEAL

Section I. "Substantial Evidence" Standard of Review

- A. Source
- B. Statutory Review Directive
- C. Interpretive Opinions Regarding Substantial Evidence Review
- D. Circumstantial Evidence Review: Circumstances Consistent With Either of Two Facts Where Neither More Probable

Section II. Notice of Appeal

**Section III. Where to File Appeal: County Court at Law
in County of Arrest**

- A. Generally
- B. Wrong County Equals Jurisdictional Defeat of Appeal
- C. Procedure in County Courts

Section IV. (Very) Temporary Stay of Suspension

Section V. Record

- A. Cost
- B. New Deadline for Requesting Record
- C. Burden to File and to Present the Record
- D. Incomplete Record

Section VI. Additional Evidence

**Section VII. Effect of Successful Appeal on DPS Driving Record:
Absent a Request to the Contrary**

- A. Policy Absent Request
- B. Request Pursuant to 37 Tex. Admin. Code § 17.11(e):
A Notification Request Should Be Made

Section VIII. Further Appellate Review by the Courts of Appeals

- A. No Review by Courts of Appeals?
- B. Authority to Modify a Judgment

CHAPTER 16

CHAPTER 522. (Selections) TEXAS TRANSPORTATION CODE COMMERCIAL DRIVER'S LICENSES AND ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION SUSPENSIONS AND RELATED SECTIONS

- Subchapter A. General Provisions
- Subchapter B. License or Permit Required
- Subchapter C. License or Permit Application and Issuance
- Subchapter F. Notification of Conviction, Administration Action,
or Previous Employment
- Subchapter G. Unauthorized Driving
- Subchapter H. Disqualification From Driving Commercial Motor Vehicle
- Subchapter I. Driving While Having Alcohol, Controlled Substance,
or Drug in System

CHAPTER 17

SUSPENSIONS AND MINORS TEXAS TRANSPORTATION CODE

Section I. Test Failure: § 524

- A. § 524.001. Definitions
- B. § 524.011. Officer's Duties for Driver's License Suspension
- C. § 524.012. Department's Determination for Driver's
License Suspension
- D. § 524.022. Period of Suspension
- E. § 524.023. Application of Suspension Under Other Laws
- F. § 524.035. Hearing
- G. § 524.042. Stay of Suspension of Appeal
- H. § 524.043. Review: Additional Evidence

Section II. Test Refusal: § 724

- A. § 724.001. Definitions
- B. § 724.011. Consent to Taking of Specimens
—Implied Consent Law
- C. § 724.012. Taking of Specimen
- D. § 724.015. Information Provided by Officer
Before Requesting Specimen
- E. § 724.035. Suspension or Denial of License

Section III. Driving Under the Influence of Alcohol by a Minor (Effective September 1, 1997, for Offenses Committed On or After That Date)

- A. A Minor Who Is Not a Child
- B. A Minor Who Is a Child

Section IV. Representing Minors in the Age of "Zero Tolerance"

- A. Possessory Offenses and Automatic License Suspensions
- B. Driving Under the Influence of Alcohol by a Minor

- C. Reporting Requirements
- D. Public Intoxication by Minor/License Suspension
- E. Delinquent Conduct Definition
- F. Processing Juveniles at Adult Facilities
- G. Justice of the Peace/Municipal Court Jurisdiction
- H. Minor “ALRS” Under Transp. Code Ch. 524 (“Failures”)
- I. Minor “ALRS” Under Transp. Code Ch. 724 (“Refusals”)

CHAPTER 18

OCCUPATIONAL LICENSES TEXAS TRANSPORTATION CODE

WARNING

Subtitle B. Driver’s Licenses and Personal Identification Cards
Chapter 521. Driver’s Licenses and Certificates

CHAPTER 19

THE STATUTES: TEXAS TRANSPORTATION CODE AND CONTROLLING ORIGINAL STATUTES

Section I. Chapter 524. Administrative Suspension of Driver’s License for Failure to Pass Test for Intoxication

- Subchapter A. General Provisions
- Subchapter B. Suspension Determination and Notice
- Subchapter C. Suspension Provisions
- Subchapter D. Hearing and Appeal
- Subchapter E. Reinstatement and Reissuance of Driver’s License

Section II. Chapter 724. Implied Consent

- Subchapter A. General Provisions
- Subchapter B. Taking and Analysis of Specimen
- Subchapter C. Suspension or Denial of License on Refusal
of Specimen
- Subchapter D. Hearing
- Subchapter E. Admissibility of Evidence

CHAPTER 20

ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE AND PRACTICE: CHAPTER 2001. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE AND TEXAS REGISTER ACT

- Subchapter A. General Provisions
- Subchapter B. Rulemaking
- Subchapter C. Contested Cases: General Rights and Procedures
- Subchapter D. Contested Cases: Evidence, Witnesses, and Discovery
- Subchapter E. Contested Cases: Testimony of Child
- Subchapter F. Contested Cases: Final Decisions and Orders;
Motions for Rehearing
- Subchapter G. Contested Cases: Judicial Review
- Subchapter H. Court Enforcement

- Subchapter I. Exceptions
- Subchapter Z. Miscellaneous

Chapter 2002 Overview

- A. Generally
- B. Texas Register Publication
- C. Administrative Code Publication

CHAPTER 21

DPS RULES REGARDING ALR SUSPENSIONS

Chapter 19. Texas DPS Regulations

- Subchapter A. Breath Alcohol Testing Regulations
- Subchapter B. Texas Ignition Interlock Device Regulations

Chapter 17. Administrative License Revocation

CHAPTER 22

THE SOAH RULES OF PROCEDURE FOR ALR HEARINGS

New Rules for Conducting ALR Hearings

Title 1, Texas Administrative Code, Chapter 159, Rules of Procedure for Administrative License Suspension Hearings

Title 1, Texas Administrative Code, Chapter 155, Rules of Procedure for Administrative License Suspension Hearings

Title 1, Texas Administrative Code, Chapter 157, Temporary Administrative Law Judges

Title 1, Texas Administrative Code, Chapter 161, Requests for Records

SOAH's Comments on Amended Rules

CHAPTER 23

APPLICABLE TEXAS RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE

Rule 18b. Grounds for Recusal Disqualification and of Judges

SOAH Rule § 159.103

Rule 176.5. Service [*Successor to Rule 178*]

Rule 176.7. Protection of Person From Undue Burden and Expense

192.3. Scope of Discovery

192.4. Limitations on Scope of Discovery

192.5. Work Product

192.6. Protective Orders

192.7. Definitions

193.2. Objecting to Written Discovery

193.3. Asserting a Privilege

193.7. Production of Documents Self-Authenticating

Rule 196. Requests For Production and Inspection To Parties;

Requests and Motions For Entry Upon Property

196.1. Request for Production and Inspection to Parties

196.2. Response to Request for Production and Inspection

196.3. Production

196.6. Expenses of Production

- 205.2. Notice
- 205.3 Production of Documents and Tangible Things
Without Deposition
- 215.2 Failure to Comply With Order or With Discovery Request
- 215.3 Abuse of Discovery Process in Seeking, Making,
or Resisting Discovery

APPENDIX A

ALR PRACTICE FORMS

No. Title of Form and (Format Type)

- 1 Request for Hearing—Refusal (Fax/Request)
- 2 Request for Hearing—Failure (Fax/Request)
- 3 Request for Hearing—DUIM (Fax/Request)
- 4 Agreed “5-Day” Continuance (Fax/Request)
- 5 Motion For Continuance (Motion)
- 6 Motion to Transfer Venue (Motion)
- 7 Discovery Request—Refusal (Letter/Fax)
- 8 Discovery Request—Breath Test Failure (Letter/Fax)
- 9 Discovery Request—Blood Test Failure (Letter/Fax)
- 10 Motion to Compel—Failure (Motion)
- 11 Request for ALJ-Issued Subpoena (Form)
- 12 Affidavit in Support of Good Cause to Issue Subpoena
for Technical Supervisor
- 13 ALJ-Issued Subpoena
- 14 ALR Witness Fee Calculation Sheet
- 15 Defense Attorney-Issued Subpoena Form—*Front* Side (Form)
- 16 Defense Attorney-Issued Subpoena Form—*Back* Side (Form)
- 17 Sample Mandamus Petition to Compel ALJ to Issue
Subpoena —*Petition For Writ of Mandamus* (Petition)
- 18 Application for District Court Enforcement of
Administrative Subpoena (Petition)
- 19 Sample Cover Letter for Subpoena Request (Letter)
- 20 Sample Cover Letter for Served Subpoena (Letter)
- 21 Subpoena in Force Letter to Witness Following
Continuance (Letter)
- 22 Letter Brief in Support of Request for *Subpoena Duces
Tecum* for CMI Technical Manual (Letter/Fax)
- 23 Post-Hearing Letter Brief—Availability of Priors
for Enhancement (Letter/Fax)
- 24 Post-Hearing Letter Brief—Yield Right-of-Way (Letter/Fax)
- 25 Post-Hearing Letter Brief—Regional Hits (Letter/Fax)
- 26 Appeal of Administrative License Suspension
—Short Form (Appeal)
- 27 Appeal of Administrative License Suspension
—Brief Incorporated (Appeal)
- 28 Sample Letter Requesting SOAH Transcript
of ALR Hearing (Letter)

- 29 Sample Letter Forwarding ALR Appeal to DPS and SOAH (Letter via Certified Mail)
- 30 Sample Judgment Reversing Administrative Decision
- 31 Sample ODL Petition With Multiple Options (Petition)
- 32 Sample ODL Order With Multiple Options (Order)
- 33 Sample Letter Forwarding *Petition* and *Order Granting Occupational License* to DPS (Letter via Certified Mail)
- 34 Sample Letter Forwarding *Petition* and *Order Granting Occupational License* to Client (Letter via Hand Delivery)
- 35 Sample Letter Telling Client to Cease Driving Due to Lack of SR-22 (Letter)
- 36 Demand to DPS for Rescission After Acquittal (Letter/Fax)
- 37 Affidavit Regarding Insufficient Extrapolation Information (Affidavit)
- 38 Motion to Set Aside Default Order (Motion)
- 39 Sample Letter Requesting Hearing Compact Disc (Letter)